



PALO VERDE COLLEGE

**MIDTERM
ACCREDITATION
REPORT**

2024





PALO VERDE COLLEGE

WHERE KNOWLEDGE TAKES ROOT AND OPPORTUNITY GROWS

Palo Verde College

Midterm Accreditation Report

Submitted by

Palo Verde Community College District
1 College Drive, Blythe, California 92225

Submitted to

Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges

March 2024

Certification

To: Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges

From: Dr. Robert Miller – Interim Superintendent/President
Palo Verde College
1 College Drive
Blythe, CA 92225

This Midterm Report is submitted to the ACCJC for the purposes of 1) highlighting recent improvements or innovations and 2) providing an update on institutional performance with regard to student outcomes since the last comprehensive peer review. The Midterm Report reflects the nature and substance of this institution, as well as its best efforts to align with ACCJC Standards and policies, and was developed with appropriate participation and review by the campus community.

Signatures:

Angel Ramirez, President, Board of Trustees



Dr. Robert Miller, Interim Superintendent/President



Clint Cowden, Assistant Superintendent/Vice President, Instruction and Student Services, ALO




Richard Castillo, President, CTA



Sarah Frid, President, Academic Senate



Rich Soto, President, CSEA



Shelley Hamilton, Management/Confidential Representative



Cason, Rice, President, Associated Student Government



Table of Contents

Certification Page	2
A. Reflections on Continuous Improvement Since Last Comprehensive Review	5
1. Major improvements or innovations.	5
2. Actions taken in response to any recommendations.	10
Recommendation 1:	10
Recommendation 2:	10
Recommendation 3:	11
Recommendation 4:	11
Recommendation 5:	12
3. How are the actions helping your institution deepen its practices	12
B. Reflections on Institution-Set Standards and Other Metrics of Student Achievement	13
1. Patterns or trends in performance against your institution-set standards.	13
2. Equitable student achievement outcomes	13
3. Actions your institution has taken/is taking in response	14
C. Reflections on Assessments of Student Learning	16
1. Patterns or trends related to attainment of learning outcomes.	16
2. Patterns or trends related to equitable attainment of student learning	17
3. Actions your institution has taken/is taking in response.	18
D. Looking Ahead to the Next Self-Evaluation and Comprehensive Review	20
External Regulatory Changes	20
Emerging Educational Technologies	20
Shifts in Educational Models	20
Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion	20
Globalization and Internationalization	21
Student Data Privacy and Security	21
Financial Sustainability	21
Environmental and Sustainability Initiatives	21
Faculty and Staff Development	21
Pandemic Recovery and Resilience	21
Community Engagement	21
Zero Textbook Cost	21
Rising Scholars Program	22

A. Reflections on Continuous Improvement Since Last Comprehensive Review

1. Briefly describe major improvements or innovations since the time of the last comprehensive peer review, focusing on areas where your institution is excelling or showing significant improvement with regard to equitable student outcomes, educational quality, and/or mission fulfillment.

i. **Ensure the most current mission statement is presented in all College planning documents.** Palo Verde College reviewed and approved the existing mission statement November 2021. The mission statement is incorporated on all college planning documents and meeting agendas, including those for [college council](#) and [full admin](#) meetings. This ensures that the mission of the college remains the center focus for all college wide meetings and deliberations.

ii. Maintain currency of Institutional Effectiveness reports. The institutional effectiveness reports are updated annually. For the past five years, they have been available at the following site: <https://www.paloverde.edu/accreditation/annual-reports.aspx>.

iii. **The College will begin, in 2020, developing new goals for institution- set standards extending beyond 2023.** The discussion of the six institution set standards began with faculty deliberation during the Academic Standards Committee meetings in February 2022, followed by a discussion by all faculty at their Senate meeting in March 2022. These recommendations were forwarded to the College Council for further discussion and ratification in March 2022. The results were then disseminated college wide during the all-staff meeting in May 2022. [Palo Verde College Follow-Up Report - October 2022 \(p31-37\)](#).

Since this initial institutional set standard discussion in 2022, the district has not had any further discussions, inquiries, or re- establishment of the standards at any level.

The district hired an Institutional Researcher in August 2022, who has since departed. The expectation was that the Dean of Research, Planning, and Institutional Effectiveness would organize these discussions and forums. That did not happen.

PVC is currently advertising for a new Dean of Research, Planning and Institutional Effectiveness. When that position is filled, these discussions will continue, and institutional set standards will be developed in Spring 2024 that extend beyond the current year.

iv. **Continue the Snapshot review to identify patterns of student performance over time.** The program review cycle is typically every four years for the academic programs and two years for the career technical education or vocational programs. To ensure that student completion data is regularly tracked and disaggregated by key demographic characteristics including gender, ethnicity, incarceration, foster youth and veteran status, the snap shots for all six academic divisions are developed yearly and reviewed for allocation of physical, fiscal,

human and technology resources: <https://www.paloverde.edu/accreditation/pr.aspx>.

For PVC, the Snapshot Review is not adequate in identifying student demographic/equity data to specific programs. It is aggregated data of diverse departments within a single division. Because it is summarized, it is impossible to make real modifications or identify real needs for programs. For instance, Child Development is in the same division as Alcohol & Drug Studies. PVC's CHD courses can only be offered to community students, they are offered online and in person. Conversely, most of the students in the ADS program are incarcerated students who are either enrolled in correspondence or face to face classes. The methodology the district has chosen for the Snapshots requires all these students to be lumped into one data table. Based on this data, the divisions are asked to figure out how to rectify inequity and identify patterns of student performance over time.

The aggregation of data by division, not discipline or department, makes this review impossible. The district needs to create snapshots at the discipline level so that meaningful patterns of student performance over time can be identified.

Working with the new Dean of Research, Planning and Institutional Effectiveness, the college will ask that the data be broken down by departments so that more meaningful discussion about student performance over time can occur. This will happen in Spring 2024.

v. ***Complete update to Budget and Planning policies and practices.***

The budget and planning manual, which is the timeline and flowchart of the various processes tied to the governance of the institution was completed in July of 2021. [2021 integrated planning manual](#)

vi. ***Complete the schedule for the regular review and update of Board of Trustees' policies and administrative procedures.***

PVC's review process for board policies and administrative procedures incorporates two triggers. Firstly, following the biannual legal update revisions issued in the fall and spring by CCLC; and secondly a [six-year review cycle](#) of all policies/procedures. These were submitted for board approval in May 2023 and pulled from the agenda based on faculty concerns regarding some of the policies and procedures. They will be placed back on the board agenda during the spring 2024 semester.

vii. ***Ensure that the budget review process is understood and followed by college personnel. Revitalize budget process and coordinate the process with the Integrated Strategic Plan.***

To ensure that the budgeting process is transparent and inclusive of all constituent groups, the Budget and Planning committee uses the [BERF](#) (Budget Enhancement Request for Funding) form. This document is intended to tie the need for funding with the mission, strategic plans, program review, and goals of the college along with the health and safety of students and the community at large. The process is complex but well defined in the integrated planning manual.

Although a well-defined process exists on paper, it is not generally understood and does not work well for all constituent groups. Budget development, budget utilization, and the

allocation of funds is not perceived by all members of the campus community as consistent and transparent. There is a need for more comprehensive training and overview of the process to obtain buy-in by faculty and others on campus. The prioritization and allocation processes need to be well-defined and readily available. Regular communication with the campus community as the process evolves would be one way to improve the transparency and inclusiveness of the budget review process.

The Dean of Research, Planning, and Institutional Effectiveness, and the Assistant Superintendent/Vice President of Administrative Services and College Advancement will lead the budget development process.

The Assistant Superintendent, Vice President, Instruction and Student Services will actively engage the process to help assure all constituency groups have a voice in the process and an opportunity for active engagement.

The Superintendent/President shall serve as a catalyst for institution wide active engagement and shall have overall responsibility to assure a fair and equitable process that links planning with budget development and allocation.

viii. ***Continue ongoing changes in the College's committee and organization structure to improve dialog and decision making.***

The college's committee and reporting structure were completely reviewed and revised to include the latest positions and facilitate dialog and discussion with all constituent group members during June 2021. This process was conducted in accordance with AB 1725: 10 +1 wherein the academic and professional matters were appropriately delegated to the Academic Senate ([AP 2510](#)) This committee and organizational structure was ratified by the Board in June 2021.

ix. ***Consider developing a formal policy and administrative procedure on program discontinuance***

A formal process for the program evaluation and discontinuation was also developed in consultation with the academic senate (BP 4020, AP4020).

BP 4020 was last updated in May 2018, and AP 4020 was last updated in July 2011. No updates or revisions have occurred since these updates. Both policies were in existence at the time of the 2020 Accreditation Visit.

The current policies are not serving faculty or the existing programs well. Academic Divisions have identified several programs that should be up for program discontinuance – but the AP is too vague to be especially helpful as to how faculty (or administration) should go about processing/discussing/evaluating discontinuance.

Program discontinuance steps were put on the October 2023 Curriculum Agenda to outline the criteria, input, and thresholds to consider for a recommendation for discontinuance. The Academic Senate approved the recommendation from the curriculum committee on November 14, 2023.

The recommended steps in the process are as follows:

- a. Program Discontinuance starts with discussion and action within the Division.
 - b. Evidence is provided to the Curriculum Committee by the Division Chair to explain the Division's recommendation for dissolution.
 - c. Discussion continues within the Curriculum Committee, and a motion is made to either discontinue or to keep the program.
 - d. If the Curriculum Committee votes to discontinue the program, it then goes to the Academic Senate for discussion and a vote by the entire body.
 - e. These resolutions are then presented to the Board of Trustees.
- x. ***The librarian will conduct annual student and faculty surveys of library services to evaluate the effectiveness of library services more consistently. Include library and tutoring services in college-wide surveys.***

To include student voices (or opinions) in college planning, the college will conduct scheduled Student Satisfaction Surveys, which will include questions related to library services. The Student Satisfaction Survey will be developed and distributed during Spring, 2024.

An additional survey will be conducted in the spring, 2024, to allow faculty to evaluate the effectiveness of library services.

- xi. ***Evaluate Student Success Lab services, especially writing and English, and develop ways to complement and augment existing tutoring and student support services.***

Following COVID-19 restrictions and students and faculty allowed on campus as of Fall 2021, the Student Success Lab's usage declined.

Evening professional tutoring services (adjunct- led), focused on transfer-level math, were offered from week 3 to the end of the semester.

Due to transitions within the English department, the College faced challenges finding English tutors. The College will be hiring two new FT English faculty in the Spring 2024 to begin teaching at the college in Fall of 2024.

The Student Success Lab space is shared with student groups – PRIDE, Puente, and Umoja - as was originally intended. To enhance and support the Student Success Lab, plans for Spring 2024 include establishing the Academic Achievement Center. The Center will be funded by Hispanic-Serving Institution (HSI) grants. The Center will be established in the library, where students can go for tutoring sessions and skills- based workshops with academic coaches, tutors, mentors and advisors. The Center will also be where students, faculty and staff can access other on-site wraparound services identified in the HSI Grant.

- xii. ***Continue to refine the recently initiated annual program review process with emphasis on data collection, analysis and future planning.***

The completion of the various service area program reviews which are conducted over a three-year cycle can be found at <https://www.paloverde.edu/accreditation/pr.aspx>. These

program reviews are staggered over three years, for the sixteen service areas that have been identified by the program review committee.

The college does not have a process in place to refine and improve the existing process with emphasis on data collection, analysis, and future planning.

The college is currently working on redesigning the program review template to enhance discussion at the department level rather than the aggregate division level. This process will begin in the Spring of 2024.

xiii. ***Continue the process underway to keep Board of Trustees' policies and procedures up to date on an ongoing basis.***

When a change to board policy or administrative procedure is initiated by a problem or question, the following [flowchart](#) for decision has been recommended. The approval process includes a presentation to College Council during and dissemination to all constituent groups on campus. Upon receiving constituent group feedback, the flowchart can be formally adopted.

xiv. ***Improve the process of collaboration between the Budget and Planning Committee and the Program Review Committee to ensure that funding needs and requests resulting from department self-evaluations are fully considered by the Budget and Planning Committee.***

The [BERF](#) form is tied to resource allocation by linking the request for resources based on the department program review, and snapshots to the various goals of the institution. The money for the BERF is allocated from various sources including the college general and categorical funds, deferred maintenance/instructional equipment, grants like the SWP, and Perkins.

The amount of money allocated to this process varies annually. Once the BERF forms are completed by departments, divisions, and service areas, they are reviewed and prioritized by the Budget Committee. Funding depends on prioritization of the requests and the amount of money available for distribution. The Business Office is responsible for communication regarding funding.

Not all constituent groups understand how the collaboration between the Budget and Planning Committee and the Program Review Committee are integrated to ensure that funding needs and requests resulting from department self-evaluations are fully considered by the Budget and Planning Committee.

There needs to be an evaluation of the existing process and an opportunity for constituent groups to make recommendations for improvements.

There is a concern by the Academic Senate that the faculty voice for faculty needs is disproportionately outweighed by non-academic Budget committee members. The remedy is to have appropriate faculty representation when the academic and student services areas needs are discussed and voted upon.

xv. ***Arrange more frequent budget workshops and Galaxy training to ensure all College***

personnel are well acquainted with financial processes and procedures and can interpret financial reports more effectively.

Training is provided to all managers and Division chairs annually to help them advocate for the best possible use of resources. The last cycle of training occurred during the March/April months of 2023 leading up to the submission of the budgets for the various departments/Divisions.

xvi. ***Complete revisions and updates on AP 2510 Collegial Governance: Participation in Local Decision Making.***

The revision to AP 2510 has been completed.

<http://go.boarddocs.com/ca/pvccd/Board.nsf/goto?open&id=C2VN8J5DBEBC>. Faculty agreed to the current AP 2510 language in the Spring of 2021. It was voted upon and approved by the Academic Senate on May 11, 2021.

xvii. ***Require that key performance indicator reports and analyses of the College as a whole be presented to the Board of Trustees at least annually.***

Key performance indicator reports, and analysis of the College will be presented to the Board of Trustees annually.

The anticipated date for this presentation will be in March, 2024.

2. **Briefly describe actions taken in response to any recommendations for improving institutional effectiveness or feedback noted in the Peer Review Team Report for the last comprehensive peer review.**

Recommendations to Meet Standards:

Recommendation 1: In order to meet the Commission’s policy, the team recommends the institution widely communicate its formal student grievance process so that all students are aware of their rights and responsibilities (Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions).

The Student Grievance process is prominently displayed on the Home Page of the College webpage. A copy of the student grievance process and the grievance form is also included in the “Incarcerated Student Handbook/Orientation Guide” (2021-2022) for distribution to current and incoming students. The form is distributed to all enrolled Rising Scholar students each semester.

Additionally, communication regarding the student grievance process is sent to students via email.

www.paloverde.edu

Recommendation 2: In order to meet the Commission’s policy, the team recommends the institution establish a policy defining regular and substantive instructor-initiated contact with students for Distance Education courses. The college must provide professional development opportunities for faculty teaching online to ensure Distance Education courses include regular

and substantive instructor- student interaction (Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education).

[AP 4105](#) has been developed in consultation with faculty to meet this requirement. The latest iteration of this administrative procedure was reviewed by the College Council and then sent to the Board as an information item during February of 2023. This AP includes the provision for faculty to recommend the @one certification as the standard platform for approval to teach online. The faculty have formed an online teaching council to determine equivalencies on a case-by-case basis. The academic senate has also discussed and voted upon the rubric for determining the requirements for the continuation of the certification after the initial three years.

The College President will initiate discussions with constituent groups on the creation of an Instructional Technology and Design specialist position to better support the needs of faculty and students.

Recommendation 3: In order to meet the standard, the team recommends the institution regularly assess student learning outcomes for course, program and institutional levels and use assessment data to support student learning and achievement (I.B.2. I.B.4, II.A.3).

Student learning outcomes for course, program, and institutional level outcomes are regularly assessed by the college. <https://www.paloverde.edu/accreditation/slo.aspx>

Due to the significant turnover in administration, especially in research and planning, there is currently no process to use this data to support student learning and achievement. With the onboarding of the new Dean of Research, Planning and Institutional Effectiveness, the college will begin discussions with faculty, staff, and managers to decide how best to use this data to support student learning and achievement.

Recommendation 4: In order to meet the standard, the team recommends the institution consistently use institution-set standard data to address student achievement gaps (I.B.3).

Outcomes of the SLOs for the various courses and modalities are discussed in division meetings. Based on these deliberations, there should be investment changes made to enhance the SLO outcomes. The College needs to establish a clear process whereby we use institutional set-standard data to address student achievement gaps.

Using the data supplied in the 2019-2022 Student Equity Plan, the institution applied for and received Hispanic-Serving Institute (HSI) designation in addition to implementing the Puente Project and the Umoja Community which are two programs focused on addressing student achievement gaps for underserved students. Both programs involve faculty and support services (staff) participation, professional development, and intentional recruitment for personnel needs.

Puente is in its third year and has seen moderate growth. Umoja is rebuilding while a faculty member is training to be an on-site coordinator.

HSI funding through The ALOE Project, the Academic Achievement Center, and TRiO (disabled students) will assist in bolstering the support to address student achievement gaps through collaborative efforts between faculty and student services.

Currently, we are unable to show evidence of using institutional set standard data to address student achievement gaps. Moving forward to the Spring 2024 semester, PVC plans to include data to inform how the student achievement gaps will be closed while eliminating disproportionate impact.

Recommendation 5: In order to meet the standard, the team recommends the institution assess accomplishment of its mission through program review by consistently and systematically evaluating programs and services (I.B.5, II.A.2, II.C.1).

<https://www.paloverde.edu/accreditation/pr.aspx> - Program reviews for academic and CTE areas are conducted by designated faculty and presented by the Division Chair to the Program Review Committee. Information is then presented to the College Council and finally to the Board of Trustees. The program reviews are all up to date for 2022-23. They are in development for the 23-24 academic year.

3. How are the actions described above helping your institution deepen its practices for continuous improvement and transformation in relation to the 2024 Accreditation Standards?

Palo Verde College will be focusing on closing the loop from SLO (Student Learning Outcomes) to program review to planning and budgeting for academic and service area programs. Continuous monitoring and training will be provided beginning spring 2024 to keep faculty, staff, and managers current on the latest practices.

Reflections on Institution-Set Standards and Other Metrics of Student Achievement will be encouraged during the Council of Chairs/SLO committee meetings.

The institution will also examine and establish clear standards and practices through an equity lens that focuses on student achievement. Academic support programs offered through student services will include faculty engagement and professional development opportunities targeting underserved students. Student achievement gaps and success will be presented annually through the Dean of Institutional Research and Institutional Effectiveness and from the Student Success and Equity program. Open discussions and inclusion about best practices supported with data with all the constituent groups (division meetings, Senate, College Council, Student Equity & Achievement, etc.) will begin in Spring 2024.

B. Reflections on Institution-Set Standards and Other Metrics of Student Achievement

- 1. Review the most recent ACCJC Annual Report and other meaningful metrics of student achievement. Has the institution met its floor standards? Exceeded its stretch goals? Describe any patterns or trends you see in performance against your institution-set standards and other metrics of student achievement.**

The data below has recently been extracted from college files by our professional expert researcher. This data has not yet been presented to constituent groups to allow for meaningful discussion and analysis. Although college-wide discussions have not yet taken place, the data does show that the college has met institution-set standards and other metrics of student achievement. With the onboarding of our permanent Dean of Research, Planning and Institutional Effectiveness the college plans to disseminate the data to all constituent groups for discussion of goals, trends, and student achievement.

The interpretations below were completed by our professional expert:

- PVC has shown commendable performance in terms of student achievement metrics over the last five years. PVC's successful completion rate consistently exceeded both its standard goal of 70% and stretch goal of 77%. This achievement is impressive and indicative of the institution's commitment to academic excellence. However, a closer look at disaggregated data reveals some important patterns and trends. [Data file used for narrative.](#)
- Asian and white students have consistently outperformed the college's annual success rates. This is a positive trend and reflects the institution's ability to provide effective support to these student groups.
- African American and Hispanic students consistently perform lower than the college's average successful completion rates. This equity gap is a matter of concern and requires further attention and intervention.
- The data also highlights that younger student between the ages of 18-29 and females tend to perform lower than the college's average. Identifying the underlying reasons behind these disparities is crucial for addressing them effectively.

- 2. When you disaggregate the data for the institution-set standards and other meaningful metrics of student achievement, what do you see related to equitable student achievement outcomes (i.e., equity gaps)? What patterns or trends excite you? What patterns or trends concern you?**

Disaggregating the data has shed light on equity gaps in student achievement outcomes at PVC. While there are exciting trends, such as the success of Asian and white students, there are also concerning patterns that need to be addressed.

Exciting Trends: The success of Asian and white students is an encouraging pattern. It suggests

that the institution may have implemented effective strategies or support systems that benefit these groups. Understanding and replicating these strategies for other demographic groups could lead to more equitable outcomes.

Concerning Trends: The persistent achievement gaps for African American and Hispanic students, as well as for younger students and females, raise concerns about equity and inclusivity. These disparities indicate that certain student populations may face barriers that hinder their academic success. Addressing these gaps is a top priority for the institution.

3. What actions has your institution taken/is your institution taking in response to the patterns and trends discussed above? How will you monitor the results of these actions in order to inform future improvements and innovations in support of equitable student achievement?

The data analysis has been conducted by our professional expert. The college community has not yet had an opportunity to examine the data to review patterns and trends. Once these discussions take place, the patterns and trends will be used to inform future improvements and innovations in support of equitable student achievement.

To address the patterns and trends identified above, PVC has and will continue to take several actions:

PVC has taken steps to address the underserved students through the Puente Project and Umoja Community. The Puente Project serves first-generation Hispanic students and offers academic support in English and general studies (Intro to College/The Master Student). These projects are designed to offer additional support for students including cohorts, assigned counseling, and mentorship. Students also attend 4-year college fairs and tours. Umoja is rebuilding following personnel transitions and COVID. The plan is to implement communications, psychology, and resume college tours and fairs.

With the introduction of The ALOE Project and the Academic Achievement Center, supported with HSI funds, a larger number of students will be targeted and included to receive structured academic support such as tutoring (embedded and individual/group). Collaborative funding will be used to offer faculty and staff professional development specific to addressing equity gaps. Equity presentations from external associations (The RP Group, Puente, Umoja, etc.) will be offered on-site for institutional engagement.

Data-driven interventions: PVC will continuously monitor and analyze data to assess the effectiveness of these support programs. The College will adjust strategies based on real-time data to ensure that interventions are yielding positive results.

Inclusivity and diversity initiatives: PVC attempts to foster a campus culture that promotes inclusivity and diversity. We encourage dialogue and initiatives that promote a sense of belonging for all students, regardless of their demographic background. Groups such as the PRIDE Designee Committee and the Puente Club and Mentor Program actively organize events for students and the community recognizing their achievements and history. Faculty, staff and

students are joint members of each of the groups.

The Associated Student Government (ASG) maintains a positive campus culture for students through its various on campus events and support of Athletics.

Collaborate with external partners: The college collaborates with local K-12 schools like Palo Verde Unified and Needles Unified, community organizations, and other stakeholders to address educational disparities at an earlier stage and improve college readiness.

Long-term planning: PVC will develop a long-term plan to track progress in closing equity gaps and achieving equitable student achievement outcomes. The College will regularly update institutional goals and strategies based on the outcomes of monitoring and assessment.

The college needs to ensure that it supports a culture of curiosity and the sharing of this data.

Providing adequate spaces and structure for internal staff and faculty to reflect, assess, and suggest solutions is important. At this time, there is not enough evidence that we have invested in impactful IDEAA practices and woven them into enough systems to ensure positive impact. The college will work to improve that.

C. Reflections on Assessments of Student Learning

- 1. Review the results of learning outcomes assessment. Describe any patterns or trends related to attainment of learning outcomes observable in these data that may be relevant as you implement improvements and innovations in the design and delivery of academic programs?**

This data has recently been extracted from college files by our professional expert. The trends identified below related to the attainment of learning outcomes synthesized by the professional expert. The college will distribute this data to the Academic Senate at the beginning of the spring 2024 semester to allow for discussion on how the trends are relevant and how they can inform improvements and innovations in the design and delivery of academic programs. After these discussions have taken place, the Academic Senate will forward recommendations to the College Council. The President's Cabinet will identify specific resources needed to improve the design and delivery of academic programs.

In reviewing [the results of our learning outcomes assessment at PVC](#), the professional expert researcher has observed several notable patterns and trends that are crucial for informing improvements and innovations in our academic programs. These trends align with Standards 1.3, 2.1, 2.2, and 2.9.

Firstly, over the past three years, the College has consistently surpassed the 70% goal set for each of our six Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs). This achievement indicates that our academic programs have been effective in achieving their intended learning outcomes, reflecting on the dedication and hard work of our faculty and students. However, it is crucial to note that when we disaggregate the assessment data by different ethnic groups, we identify fluctuations and disparities that require further investigation and action.

For example:

Asian and Pacific Islander students' performance was highest in the 2020-21 academic year but saw a significant dip of almost 20 percentage points in the following year (2021-22). Fortunately, this group of students has shown some recovery in the 2022-23 academic year. These fluctuations warrant a closer examination to understand the underlying causes and ensure consistent performance.

Hispanic students, one of the largest population groups at PVC, performed at or around the college's overall averages, indicating a relatively equitable attainment of learning outcomes.

Native American/Hawaiian/Alaskan students performed well in the 2020-21 and 2021-22 academic years but experienced a decline of at least 20% in achievement for each ISLO. This decline is concerning and requires targeted interventions to address the performance gap.

African American students consistently performed below the college's averages, while white students performed at the highest levels. This persistent achievement gap is a matter of concern that demands immediate attention and tailored strategies to support equitable learning

outcomes for all student groups.

To decrease these gaps and address the concerns raised by these trends, PVC will implement targeted interventions and support mechanisms. These may include culturally responsive teaching strategies, mentorship programs, and academic support services specifically designed to assist underperforming student groups.

The College acknowledges that there is an urgent need for diversity hiring among our faculty, staff, and administrative/management personnel, particularly African American hires. Acting on this need, may have an impact on the disproportionate performance of African American students at the college.

2. How (i.e., for what subpopulations, modalities, etc.) does your institution disaggregate its assessment results? When you review disaggregated assessment results, what patterns or trends do you see related to equitable attainment of student learning? What patterns or trends excite you? What patterns or trends concern you?

The following are observations recommendations made by our professional expert researcher.

At PVC, we disaggregate our assessment results for various subpopulations and modalities to gain a comprehensive understanding of equitable attainment of student learning. This practice aligns with Standards 2.1, 2.2, and 2.9.

We disaggregate our assessment data by the following subpopulations:

Ethnic groups: We examine performance data for different ethnic groups, as highlighted in the previous section, to identify disparities and trends related to equitable attainment of learning outcomes.

Gender: We analyze the performance of male and female students separately to identify any gender- based disparities in achievement.

Age groups: We categorize students into different age groups to understand if there are variations in learning outcomes based on age.

Course delivery mode: We assess whether there are differences in learning outcomes between students in traditional classroom settings and those in online or hybrid modalities.

Patterns and trends that excite us include:

Consistently exceeding the 70% goal for ISLOs over the past three years, demonstrating overall program effectiveness.

The absence of performance gaps between general "community" students and those who are incarcerated indicates that equitable learning outcomes are being achieved across these diverse student populations.

Patterns and trends that concern us include:

Fluctuations in performance among certain ethnic groups, particularly the significant dip observed among Asian and Pacific Island students in the 2021-22 academic year.

Persistent disparities in performance between African American students and white students, highlighting an urgent need for targeted interventions.

The decline in achievement among Native American/Hawaiian/Alaskan students, which signals a potential gap in support.

These observations and recommendations need to be distributed to the campus community. Faculty need to be provided with the opportunity to interpret and evaluate the data to identify their own assessment of trends and patterns. In these discussions, faculty will be asked to identify trends that excite them and trends that concern them.

3. What actions has your institution taken/is your institution taking in response to the patterns and trends discussed above? How will you monitor the results of these actions in order to inform future improvements and innovations in support of equitable student learning?

The institution has not yet had an opportunity to respond to the patterns and trends discussed above. Once the institution has had an opportunity to respond, recommendations will be clearly defined and a method for monitoring the results of those actions will be developed. These recommendations and the monitoring of the results will inform future improvements and innovations in support of equitable student learning.

In response to the patterns and trends identified in our assessment data, PVC is taking a proactive approach to address disparities and ensure equitable student learning, in line with Standards 1.3, 2.1, 2.2, and 2.9.

Some of the actions we are taking include:

Conducting further research: We will conduct in-depth research to understand the root causes of fluctuations and disparities in performance among ethnic groups. This research will involve surveys, focus groups, and interviews with students to gather qualitative data.

Developing targeted interventions: Based on our research findings, we will design and implement targeted interventions aimed at addressing the specific needs of underperforming student groups. These interventions may include culturally responsive pedagogical practices, mentoring programs, and academic support services.

Continuous monitoring and assessment: We will establish a systematic process for ongoing monitoring and assessment of the effectiveness of our interventions. This includes tracking the progress of students in underperforming groups and evaluating the impact of support programs.

Faculty professional development: We will invest in professional development opportunities for faculty to enhance their skills in culturally responsive teaching and pedagogical approaches that promote equitable learning outcomes.

Data collection for other special populations: In line with the recommendation to collect assessment data for other special populations, we will expand our data collection efforts to ensure equity across all student groups.

By implementing these actions and closely monitoring their results, PVC aims to improve equity in student learning outcomes and promote a more inclusive and supportive academic environment. We are committed to using data-driven insights to inform future improvements and innovations in our academic programs to ensure all students have an equal opportunity to succeed.

D. Looking Ahead to the Next Self-Evaluation and Comprehensive Review

Your institution will begin its next comprehensive self-evaluation in 1-2 years. What opportunities, changes, or other internal or external factors do you see on the horizon that are likely to affect the context of your self-evaluation and/or comprehensive peer review?

The college looks forward to the complete sharing of data with all constituent groups with the expectation that meaningful conversations, analyses, and recommendations will take place. We will be working with our research team to disaggregate the data by other underrepresented groups. It is expected that these data sharing meetings will occur throughout the spring 2024 semester.

As we look ahead to the next comprehensive self-evaluation and peer review of our institution, several opportunities, changes, and internal/external factors are likely to affect the context of this process.

These factors will play a significant role in shaping the direction and focus of our self-evaluation:

External Regulatory Changes: One of the most prominent factors affecting our next self-evaluation will be any changes in external regulatory requirements or accreditation standards. Accrediting bodies like ACCJC are updating their standards or expectations, necessitating adjustments in our institution's practices and documentation to align with new criteria. Palo Verde College will also have to be responsive to changes in Title 5, CA Education Code and other federal agencies like Department of Education that control FAFSA and return to Title IV.

Emerging Educational Technologies: The rapid advancement of educational technologies, such as online learning platforms, AI-driven assessment tools, and virtual reality, will impact how we deliver education and assess student learning. We will need to evaluate how these technologies enhance or change our instructional methods and student support services. At our Technology Committee meetings, we have begun the discussion of how AI can be used in education. Our next steps will be to evaluate the impact at the Academic Standards meeting and then consideration by the entire senate for appropriate policy formulation.

Shifts in Educational Models: Changes in educational models, such as competency-based education, micro-credentials, or stackable certificates, may gain prominence. We should anticipate how these models could influence our curriculum, credentialing, and student success strategies. PVC has developed AP 4235 which deals with credit for prior learning in consultation with faculty.

Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion: We will review our Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion manual to ensure we stay committed to the statewide, national, and global conversations around diversity, equity, inclusion, and accessibility that continue to influence higher education. Our institution must stay committed to DEIA for the best outcomes for all students. This focus will be central to our self-evaluation and efforts to create an inclusive learning environment on an ongoing basis. We are strategizing HSI, SEA, Adult Education, and other categorical funding to continue to support academic achievement through support programs and services and ongoing professional development to the institution to remain relevant and to address equity gaps in a positive and direct manner.

Globalization and Internationalization: Increasing globalization in higher education may lead to greater international collaboration, study abroad opportunities, and the need to assess global competencies among our students. Preparing students for a globalized world will be a critical aspect of our self-evaluation. Palo Verde College has six institutional learning outcomes in place which prioritize and monitor the preparation of its students to meet this goal.

Student Data Privacy and Security: As data breaches and privacy concerns become more prevalent, safeguarding student data will be paramount. We will need to evaluate our data management practices and ensure compliance with evolving data protection regulations. While many of our sister colleges have been hacked and their systems held to ransom, Palo Verde College prioritizes training like FERPA, Cybersecurity and lately our Information Technology Department has invested in the latest methodologies that are required by the California Community College's Chancellors' office.

Financial Sustainability: Financial challenges in higher education could persist or intensify. Preparing for potential budgetary constraints and identifying strategies to maintain financial sustainability will be part of our self-evaluation. During the past years, PVC has successfully built up to 45% reserves with respect to the operating capital and has consistently met the 50% law requirement.

Environmental and Sustainability Initiatives: Sustainability and environmental concerns are gaining importance. Evaluating our institution's commitment to sustainability, energy efficiency, and environmental stewardship will become a part of our self-evaluation process.

Faculty and Staff Development: As the landscape of higher education evolves, faculty and staff development will remain crucial. Assessing our professional development programs and support for faculty and staff will be integral to enhancing institutional effectiveness. To promote robust faculty participation in the collegial governance process as mandated by AB 1725: 10+1 in professional and academic matters, there has been a move to devote additional release time to key offices like Academic Senate President, California Teachers Association office holders for negotiations etc.

Pandemic Recovery and Resilience: The ongoing impact of the COVID-19 pandemic and the potential for future disruptions will necessitate a thorough assessment of our institution's resilience and preparedness. Our self-evaluation should consider lessons learned from the pandemic. While PVC was fortunate not to experience a decline in enrollment due to the pandemic, we are striving to improve communication and engagement of our student services to the main campus population.

Community Engagement: Strengthening community partnerships and engagement will be important for our institution's relevance and impact. Evaluating our outreach and collaboration with local and regional communities should be part of our self-evaluation efforts. Palo Verde College is including the Palo Verde Unified school district personnel as community members in the screening and selection of our next President/Superintendent.

Zero Textbook Cost: PVC students face challenges due to the high expenses of textbooks required for their courses. In response, the faculty at PVC has proactively sought out Online Education Resources (OERs), which can be freely accessed online or printed at a minimal cost. These efforts

extend to various degree programs, including History, Psychology, Sociology, Child Development/Early Childhood Education, and General Education courses.

Rising Scholars Program: This program has a significant impact, reaching nearly 41% of our Full-Time Equivalent Students (FTES) and approximately 50% of our unique student headcount. The program holds immense importance, not only aligning with the California Department of Correction and Rehabilitation's mission to reduce recidivism but also for PVC itself. During the fall of 2023, PVC served over 15 California Department of Correction and Rehabilitation (CDCR) locations. Beginning in the spring of 2024, the number of CDCR locations served will be reduced to seven, including two that are within the district.

PVC's objective is to provide equitable instructional and student support services to our Rising Scholar students.

In conclusion, the next comprehensive self-evaluation and peer review of our institution will take place in a dynamic and evolving higher education landscape. By proactively addressing these opportunities, changes, and external factors, we can ensure that our institution remains responsive to the needs of our students and stakeholders and continues to meet the highest standards of quality and effectiveness in education.